## REFUTATION OF THE DOUBTS OF THE APOSTATES AND HYPOCRITES (2)

# Creatures "Creating and Living in Communities"



الحمد لله رب العالمين والصلاة والسلام على أشرف الأنبياء والمرسلين

The character to the right is a smug, self-proclaimed apostate<sup>1</sup> who produces shallow critiques of Islām, the Qur'ān and the Prophet (متركة المنابعة) in exchange for financial support from his pleasure-seeking audience to the tune of thousands per month, a



miserable price for telling lies—similar to how a prostitute sells her body, dignity and honour for a miserable price for the pleasure of anyone who pays.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> He refers to himself as an "apostate" within his branding and marketing.

The tactic is to **quickfire** a long list of doubts so that collectively they appear very weighty and to make it difficult to respond to each one, as most people will not have the patience to hear explanations of each one, and most people do not have the means (the tools and resources) to verify the claims made. So with that in mind, we will choose a set of these doubts and through them, establish that this individual is **a resentful liar**.

### The Doubt:

Regarding the verse:

وَمَا مِن دَابَتَةٍ فِي ٱلْأَرْضِ وَلَا طَبِّرٍ يَطِيرُ بِجَنَاحَيْهِ إِلَّا أَمَمُ أَمْنَالُكُم

"There is not a moving (living) creature on earth, nor a bird that flies with its two wings, but are nations (species) like you." (6:38).

The apostate added his title thus:

#### 2. All creatures create communities like humans. (Quran 6:38)

This doubt continues from the first one. The apostate claimed: "Let me go on and show a lot of things that are either completely false or even just weird in the Qur'ān. Muslims pass around this one thing so often, that Allāh created every living thing in pairs" and he alludes to the verse, upon the translation he used: "And of all things We created two mates" (51:49). Then he says: "And I

also want to combine this with my second point that every living thing, every animal, anything that lives, creates communities. We know by now in the 21st century that that is absolutely not true. There are enough living beings, enough animals that don't come in pairs and that also don't live in societies. Many animals reproduce by themselves, so the Qur'ān is wrong here..."

As for the issue of sexual and asexual reproduction, we have addressed this already in the first part. What concerns us here is the issue of "creatures creating communities and living in societies".

#### **Response to the Apostate**

1. First of all note that the dishonest apostate—in his presentation of this doubt—tried to portray that the Qur'ān says that **animals create and live in societies** similar to how humans create and live in societies. His distorted title for this doubt is "All creatures create communities like humans", and this establishes his dishonesty in citation. That is not what the verse textually states and nor what it means. The verse states that animals and birds are nations, just like humans are a nation, with the meaning of species, a type. And the meaning is that just as you are created, they are created and just as the means of your provision are designated

and specified for you, likewise their provision has been specified and designated. And just as you have a form or appearance and a name ("humans", "men" etc.) then likewise, they have forms and names such as "bird, dog, lizard, ant, spider..." and so on. Thus, all spiders, collectively, are a nation, just as all men are a nation. And all ants, or all elephants, are a nation, just as all men are a nation. In other words, this is pointing to animals and birds being a species of creation.

2. Imām al-Baghawī (d. 516H) cites from Mujāhid: "Assorted species (aṣnāf muṣannafah) known by their names", he intends that every species of the living is an ummah (nation)." Al-Baghawī explains the intent of Mujāhid by saying that every species is treated as a nation through the name it has been given, similar to when it is said "men" and "jinn". And he also cites from Ibn Qutaybah: "Nations like you, in sustenance, seeking provision and being cautious of the affairs that cause them to perish."

**3.** Imām al-Ṭabarī (d. 310) states: "He made all of them as assorted species (ajnās mujannasah) that are known as you are known and which behave in the manner they have been subjected [to behave] just as you behave." He cites from Qatādah: "Birds are a nation, men are a nation, the jinn are a nation." And he cites from al-Sudiyy: "Except [that they are a] creation

just like you." **Ibn Kathīr** (d. 774H) gives the same commentary as al-Ṭabarī, citing the very same statements.

4. Imām al-Qurțubī (d. 671H) stated: "Meaning, they are groups (jamā'āt) just like you in that Allāh ( are groups (jamā'āt) just like you in that Allāh ( are groups (jamā'āt) just like you in that Allāh ( are unjust to them. Thus it is not desirable that you are unjust to them and nor that you transgress beyond what you have been commanded regarding them." He also cites from al-Zajjāj: "Meaning, in creation, sustenance, death and resurrection".

**5.** Al-Māwardī (d. 451H) explains: "But are nations, like you' has two explanations. The first that they are groups (jamāʿāt) and the second, that they are species, this was said by al-Farrā'. And as for the intent behind 'like you', there are two angles. The first, that they are species and are distinguished [from each other] by their forms and names. The second that they are created, are are not to be oppressed, and are provided for, they are not prevented [from their means of provision]. "

From the above it should be clear that the verse in question is speaking about the creation of animals and birds into species, or genuses or types and so on, each having their own physical form, means of provision and appropriate name and they are similar to men in the sense that they have a form and appearance, have a name ("humans", "men"), have means of provision and reproduce and die.

As for the issue of "community" or "society", then each species has been given its own form and degree of interaction with other members of its species. Thus there is a way that ants live, function and interact with each other and likewise, the bees and likewise lions and fish and so on. In some cases there is a high degree of cooperation and interaction and in others less so, depending on the nature of the habitat and means of sustenance. All creatures have a level of awareness of meaning, reason and decision making suited to its particular form of mating, reproduction, food, drink and abode. And within this there are degrees of cooperation that bring notions of "family" and "community" among these creatures.

However, the apostate tried his hardest to try and make it look as if the Qur'ān in that particular verse is saying that just like you humans create society and high civilisation and preside or rule over each other and organise your activities and dicate laws and so on, then all animals and bird do the same, they create societies. And this is not what the verse says, and this exposes the apostate as a wanton, depraved liar because he inserted into the text what is not even there, "animals create communities like humans".

As for the concept of "community" among animals, it is known and studied. In fact, even among trees, it is discovered that trees of different species create underground information communication networks via their roots, have "social lives" and operate like a "community", supporting each other. For example there is a fascinating TED talk titled, "How trees talk to each other" in which there is the description: "A forest is much more than what you see,' says ecologist Suzanne Simard. Her 30 years of research in Canadian forests have led to an astounding discovery—trees talk, often and over vast distances. Learn more about the harmonious yet complicated social lives of trees and prepare to see the natural world with new eyes."<sup>2</sup>

In short, this particular verse does not state what the apostate claimed that it states. He got misled by the translations of the word "umam", as "communities" twisting this to mean "creating and living as a society" as we find in a highly organised way in humans. The verse states that just as humans are a species, a nation, then animals and birds are also species, nations. So this is a reference to the aṣnāf, or ajnās (genus, types,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Refer to https://www.ted.com/talks/suzanne\_simard\_how\_ trees\_talk\_to\_each\_other?language=en

categories). As for the notion of "community", then each species has been programmed and inspired with a level of awareness, reasoning and decision making, along with cooperation with others from its species that is suited to its physical form, its habitat and its provision. And within this there will be varying degrees of "community" to be found in various species.

In another verse, Allāh (عَرَقِجَلَ) said:

قَالَ رَبُّنَا ٱلَّذِيٓ أَعْطَى كُلَّ شَيْءٍ خَلْقَهُ و ثُرَّ هَدَى

"He (Moses) said, 'Our Lord is He who gave each thing its form and then guided it [as to its pursuits and modes of activity]'." (20:50).

The Qur'ānic exegetes explain that the guidance referred to here is with respect to the degree of awareness [of meaning] and reason required and suited for each form of biological life to pursue its beneficial interests.<sup>3</sup> Each creature is "guided to its form of mating, reproduction, food, drink and abode."<sup>4</sup> Each is programmed with its own instinct and behaviour. So under this verse, we can place the "community" aspect of many biological species, in that each of those species has been created and guided to its behaviour.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Refer to the explanations of al-Tabarī, al-Saʿdī, al-Baghawī.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> As related by al-Tabarī in his tafsīr from Ibn 'Abbās.

As such, the Qur'ān provides both of these meanings, the first of which is general in the sense that all creatures are species with their physical forms and names. And then each one of those species has been giving its own instinct and mode of behaviour, and thus some will have highly developed community-like behaviours (like ants and bees for example) and others less so.

So there is nothing in this doubt for the apostate walhamdulillāh. From what has preceded, the wise and honest person knows that this apostate is a shallow, deluded individual trying to be intellectual in front of an audience that does not know any better and that is willing to pay him for entertainment with his falsehoods and frivolities, the while he exposes his own ignorance and demonstrates that he is nothing short of a resentful liar and not an honest truth seeker by any means.

> Abu ʿlyaaḍ 3 Safar 1440 / 12 October 2018 v1.04

**Note:** In general, apostates are either confused individuals who think they are upon something or those who develop emotional, financial or ideological grounds for leaving Islam due to maltreatment, bad experiences and so on, and then they try to intellectualise and rationalise their decision. However, there are also those that believe they have strong intellectual grounds and may be sincere in that belief. However, that sincerity can easily be

tested through the removal of their doubts. It is important to note that we distinguish between the type of apostate we are refuting in these articles—one that is active in spreading deliberate lies and disinformation and for whom sincerity and pursuit of truth cannot be affirmed— and those who are genuinely confused and believe they have some rational or intellectual basis for what they are upon. For such people, gentleness and an understanding of their situation and circumstances is no doubt required. As for propagandists and deliberate, calculated liars, then they are treated as liars are to be treated.